

To Accreditation Council  
Of Eurasian Center for Accreditation  
And Quality Assurance  
In Higher Education and Health Care  
02.03.2022

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
BASED ON THE RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL  
PROGRAMME  
IN THE SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY  
7R01112 “DERMATOVENEROLOGY, ADULTS, CHILDREN”  
OF NEI "KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR  
COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF  
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF  
RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS**

**period of external expert evaluation: 16-18.02.2022**

**almaty, 2022**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3-4
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1.	Presentation of "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"	4-5
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	5
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions	5-8
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8-13
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	14-18
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"	18-27
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"	27
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	28
8.	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational programme of the residency in the specialty of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"	29
9.	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	30-31
10.	Attachment 3. Organization Visit Programme	32-36

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GD RoK	Government Decree of the RK
NEI	Non-State educational institution
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health care
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
HEI	higher education institution
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
SC	Scientific Council
AC	Academic Council
CEP	Committee of Educational Programmes
AMP	Administrative and managerial staff
TS	Teaching staff
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EP	Educational programme
DP&CEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CIS	Control measuring instruments
QEP	Quality of the educational process
AC	Attestation Committee
RIWP	Resident Individual work plan
RIWT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
IWS	Independent work of the student (resident)
EPL	Curriculum
WC	Work Curriculum
TEP	Typical educational plan
RW	Research work
EEC	External expert commission
NLA	Normative legal acts
EMS	Emergency medical services
PHC	Primary health care
EDM	Emergency and Disaster Medicine
MTB	Material and technical base
PD	Profiling Disciplines

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 02 dated 02.02.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" in the period of 16-18.02.2022, consisting of the following:

№ п/п	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the Medical University of Karaganda, member of the International Surgery Society
2	Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Research, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with the Course of Forensic Medicine of the St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences
3	Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Economics, Management and Medical Law, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention and the Faculty of Higher Nursing Education of the Volga Research Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod
4	Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pharmacology named after MD, prof. Musina M.N. NJSC "Semey Medical University"
5	Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva	deputy Chief Physician for pediatric SCP at the Medical Center "City Polyclinic No.29"
6	Resident Representative	Ermekbai Aibek Amanzholuly	Resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including pediatric" of the "Asfendiyarov KazNMU"

Observer for ECAQA – Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the ECAQA (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The ECAQA report contains the assessment of Dermatovenerology for adults, children EP for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialty) of Medical Organizations of Education and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), the ECAQA recommendations for further improvement of approaches and

conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, bin	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300
Management body	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants Executive body – Rector Control body – Audit Commission Collegiate body – Academic Council
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created on	1992 y.
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Year 2013
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	34 graduates, including 11 transferred from KazMUNO
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	10 trainees
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	4/1, 90%

### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Previous specialized accreditation of the programme 6R111400 "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" was carried out by the Accreditation Agency NAAR (IAAR) for a period of 5 years (03.10.2016 – 02.10.2016) with the issuance of a certificate dated 30.10.2016, registration number AB1085

### 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions

The self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" (hereinafter – the report) is presented on 110 pages of the main text, applications on 25 pages, copies or electronic versions of 96 documents located [at cloud.krmu@gmail.com](mailto:cloud.krmu@gmail.com) .

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" Dr. med., Professor Dzhainakbayev N.T., which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 12 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme.

The self-assessment of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On approval of the composition of the working group for self-assessment and preparation for accreditation of the educational programme 7R01112" Dermatovenerology for adults, children".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert A.K. Akhmetova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology of NJSC "MUS" and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes.

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended and supplemented accordingly according to the recommendations of the reviewer.

In all standards, the real practice of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" on the training of residents in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" is given, taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021-2022 academic year, reasoned data, examples of implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear, understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and figures (diagrams) contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of the external expert evaluation**

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health Care» No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by order No.02 dated February 02, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector of the NEI "KRMU" Professor Dzhainakbayev NT. Dates of the visit to the organization: February 16-18, 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme of the External Expert Commission of the NI "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health Care», which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

The participation of foreign expert Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov, MD, professor, vice-rector for scientific work, head of the department of pathological anatomy with a course of forensic medicine of the St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation is provided on the zoom platform (video recordings are archived in the accreditation body). The second foreign expert – Pozdeeva Tatyana Vasilievna, MD, Professor, Head of the Department of Economics, Management and Medical Law, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention and the Faculty of Higher Nursing Education of the Volga Research Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod was personally present in the work of the commission.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 16 people in total;
- interviews with residents – a total of 93 people, including 5 residents of dermatovenerologists;
- website study <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/>
- interviewing 21 employees, 43 teachers, including 3 from the Department of Dermatovenerology;
- questionnaires for teachers and residents - 113 and 200, respectively;
- observation of training of residents: attendance of 1 practical lesson on the topic: "Allergodermatoses", professor Askarova G.K., contingent of students - residents of the 2nd year of training, venue - Regional skin and venereal medicine dispensary;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 3 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including the Oblast Skin and Venereal Dispensary, located at: Demchenko 83 str., where training is conducted on one educational programme with the participation of 2 full-time teachers and 2 clinical mentors;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 19 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members**

№	Full name	Job Title
1	Tolybekova Alima Almasovna	Head of the Department of Dermatovenerology with a course of phthisiology
2	Satvaldieva Adiya Davitovna	lecturer of the Department of Dermatovenerology with a course of phthisiology
3	Amrina Leila Kazievna	lecturer of the Department of Dermatovenerology with a course of phthisiology
4	Sahabaeva Elvira Erlanovna	Resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"
5	Abzelbekova Janerke Erbolkyzy	Resident of the 2nd year of study in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"
6	Zhondibay Sanzhar Bakytuly	Resident of the 2nd year of study in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"
7	Aziza Mukasheva	Resident of the 2nd year of study in the specialty

		"Dermatovenerology for adults, children"
8	Zhondibay Sanzhar Bakytuly	Resident of the 2nd year of study in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"
9	Chernova Olesya	Dermatovenerologist (2019 edition)
10	Velichkina Vilena	Dermatovenerologist (2019 edition)
11	Abilkasimova Gulnara Erdenovna	DVC Clinic Director
12	Asanova Nazgul Ungarsynovna	Deputy Chief Physician of Children's City Clinical Hospital No. 2

In the course of the work of the EEC, a meeting was held between the members of the EEC and the management, namely with the rector and vice-rectors, heads of structural units: the head and chief specialist of the residency department, the chairperson of the CEP residency, the head of the Career Center, the department of international cooperation and academic mobility, the head of the department of science, the head of the department of personnel. Interviews were conducted with heads of residency programmes, residents, teachers, employers and residency graduates. As a result of meetings and conversations, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for the period of 5 years was reviewed, including such areas as: 1. Mission, Vision and Values, 2. Market analysis. Expectations Analysis, 3. SWOT analysis (description of strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats), 4. strategic objectives, including 4.1. Improving the quality of services through the development of the university's EP, 4.2. Internationalization and development of scientific potential of the university, 4.3. Ensuring the growth of the efficiency of university management through the digitalization of activities, 4.4. Improving the efficiency of human capital management, 4.5. Formation of the university image in the education market, 4.6. Modernization of the material and technical base of the University. This confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

In the documents of the organization there are educational programmes, UIMC, where the goal is defined, the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work is taken into account. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending a practical lesson for residents on the topic of "Allergodermatoses", the volume of hours - 6, experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, residents answer tests and oral questions, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill of practical work with patients with dermatoses, have the opportunity to independently supervise and examine. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of ethics (order No. 347/1 of December 12, 2017) and during the interview the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

When attending a practical lesson on the topic of "Allergodermatoses", a volume of 6 hours and talking to residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including at the bedside of the patient. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of EP



and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes. The residents also noted that once a month a scientific article on the diagnosis and treatment of dermatosis is discussed.

The study of control and measuring tools (tests in the disciplines of EP, clinical tasks, portfolio, checklists for skills assessment) showed that the organization has introduced an appropriate evaluation policy that allows a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents spoke about the forms of assessment, for example, working with a standardized patient in the absence of a real patient and assessing the skill on a checklist and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with an employee of the NEI KRMU, Head of the Residence Department Orakbai L.Zh., the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operating plans, annual reports, provisions of divisions, contracts with teachers and residents, contracts with clinical bases, and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents: residency programmes, entrance exams, a list of documents, information about the university and information that is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with the chairperson of the CEP postgraduate education Ligai Z.N.

The conversation with the Vice-Rector for Research and Clinical Work Zh.A. Imanbayeva and the Head of the Residence Department L.Zh. Orakbay included such issues as cooperation with clinical bases, the Regulation on clinical bases, the Regulation on clinical mentors, the rules of admission to the Residence and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (4 people in total for such teachers in dermatovenerology), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since part-time teachers need training in teaching methods and assessment of residents.

An interview with 3 teachers of the Dermatovenereology for Adults and Children programme, including 3 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to the equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with standard 4.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation

During visits to clinical bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time,

residents would like more independence in the management of patients, the conduct of international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, funding. Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaires of residents).

Interviews with 13 employers, including 2 dermatovenereologists, were conducted online and included such issues as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, about the percentage of employed residency graduates, etc.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, one of three clinical bases was visited: a regional skin and venereal medicine dispensary with a total bed capacity of 60 24-hour beds and 10 beds of a day hospital, and employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

During the visit, it was revealed that residents at the clinical base have full access to documentation, patients, equipment. Residents were active, demonstrated the skills of examining a patient with a skin pathology, answered questions by specialty and general questions. But at the same time, it should be noted that the material and technical base is outdated: the wards require repair, there is no equipment (for example: a dermatoscope with software support, manual dermatoscopes, a light camera, etc.)

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, interviews, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 7R01112" Dermatovenereology for adults, children " for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards." No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, and the chairperson of Turgunov E.M. held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period – 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the Chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

**Conclusion:**

Thus, the external evaluation and the visit of the members of the EEC allowed to verify and validate the data of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of the residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenereology for adults, children" in full in accordance with the Regulation on the

External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external evaluation of the medical organization of education of the ECAQA.

#### **4. Results of the survey**

In the period from 16.02-18.02.2022, the observer from ECAQA conducted an online questionnaire at <https://webanketa.com/>.

##### **The resident survey includes 22 questions.**

In total 200 people (in total 7 residents – dermatovenerologists for the current year) answered.

The first question "I am" showed that out of 200 respondents, more than half of the respondents are residents of the 1st year of study (103 people/51.5%), 67 people (33.5%) in the second year of study and only 7 people noted that they are graduates of KRMU, i.e. students of the 3rd year (3.5%). The vast majority of respondents, 175 people (87.5%), would recommend studying at KRMU to their environment, 22 people (11%) partially agreed with this statement, 1 person (0.5%) will not recommend this university completely and 2 people (1%) found it difficult to answer. 178 residents (89%) believe that programme managers and teachers are aware of students' learning problems, 18 people (9%) partially support this statement, completely disagree and questioned the answer for 2 students (1%). When asked about the fact that programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (academic council, academic council, committees of educational programmes) 179 residents (89.5%) answered in the affirmative, 5 people (2.5%) wrote that they are not involved in advisory bodies, 6 people (3%) answered "I do not know anything about it", "I doubt with the answer" and 4 people (2%) chose the answer "sometimes". The assessment of satisfaction with the conditions for training and the equipment of training rooms and classrooms of the KRMU showed that 175 people out of 200 (87.5%) were completely satisfied with the provided conditions, 21 people (10.5%) were partially satisfied, 2 people (1%) were not completely satisfied and 1 person (0.5%) chose the answers "partially dissatisfied".

The overwhelming majority also answered positively to the question whether the conditions for rest and meals for students (recreation rooms, benches/gazebos on the territory, canteen) were created in this educational organization, 171 people (85.5%), 12 people (6%) partially agreed and 7 people (3.5%) completely disagreed with this statement. The equipment of office equipment in classrooms and on clinical bases fully satisfies 165 respondents (82.5%), partially 29 people (14.5%), completely does not satisfy 3 people (1.5%), partially disagree with the statement of 2 people (1%) and doubted the answer of 1 resident (0.5%). 174 residents (87%) believe that teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, 23 students (11.5%) chaotically agree, 2 people (1%) completely disagree with this statement and 1 resident (0.5%) doubted the answer.

Out of the surveyed residents, 176 people (88%) noted that in the KRMU there is access to the participation of students in research work, 22 people (11%) partially agree, 1 person (0.5%) completely disagree, 1 person (0.5%) doubted the answer to this statement. The majority of residents were satisfied with the resources of the library fund, which is 171 people (85.5%). At the same time, 22 people (11%) are partially satisfied, 6 people (3%) are not completely satisfied, and 1 resident (0.5%) does not answer this question. 176 residents (88%) were completely satisfied with access to electronic educational resources, 18 people (9%) were partially satisfied, 4 people (2%) were completely dissatisfied with access to educational resources, and 1 person (0.5%) were not partially satisfied and did not respond.

In the KRMU, 170 people (85%) were completely satisfied with the availability of medical services for a student, 22 students (11%) were partially satisfied, they were not satisfied with the availability of medical services and did not give an answer to 4 people (2%).

When conducting the survey, 183 people (91.5%) were satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators, research managers, 14 people (7%), 2 people (1%) were not completely satisfied, 1 resident (0.5%) did not have an answer.

191 students (95.5%) noted that teachers and employees of the organization of education

respect students. 7 people (3.5%) disagree with this statement, 2 residents (1%) did not have an answer. 179 people (89.5%) of residents agree with the statement that social programmes to support students exist and are implemented in the organization of education. 6 people (3%) did not agree, 9 people (4.5%) did not hear about such programmes, 2 people (1%) answered "what is it" and 4 people (2%) did not answer. When asked about the availability of a career counselling service in an educational institution, 183 residents (91.5%) responded positively, 2 people (1%) gave a negative answer, 11 people (5.5%) did not hear about this organization 14 people (2%) doubted the answer. The question in the questionnaire that in the organization of education the system of independent training of students, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students and listeners at the majority of pupils is established, 181 people (90.5%), gave a positive answer. In part, 15 people (7.5%) agreed with this statement, 2 residents (1%) disagreed completely, and doubted the answer of 2 people (1%). 174 residents (87%) rated the organization of clinical (practical) training as "excellent", "good" was noted by 23 people (11.5%), 2 people answered "satisfactory", 1 (0.5%) unsatisfactory. When asked whether there is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, surgical assistance, work in laboratories and pharmaceutical production), 190 residents (95%) gave an answer "agree completely", 8 people (4%) "agree partially", 2 people (1%) "DO not agree completely".

185 students (92.5%) were fully satisfied with the schedule of classes in the disciplines of the educational programme, 14 people (7%) were partially satisfied, 1 resident (0.5%) was not satisfied. 180 students (90%) are completely satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills, 19 people (9.5%) are partially satisfied, 1 resident (0.5%) would like to change them. To the question, the content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty meets my expectations 185 residents (92.5%) gave the answer "yes, completely", 14 people (7%) "partially", 1 person (0.5%) "no".

181 residents (90.5%) noted that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, 14 people (7%) sometimes, 4 people (2%) rarely and 1 resident (0.5%) answered "never used". When asked how often a teacher is late for class, 187 people (93.5%) answered that "there was no such thing", 10 people (5%) answered "sometimes", 2 people answered "systematically" and 1 resident (0.5%) "I do not know what to answer". 180 people (90%) noted that constantly after the end of classes the teacher conducts feedback (listens to the opinion, carries out a mini-questionnaire, carries out work on mistakes), 15 people (7.5%) answered that sometimes, 3 people (1.5%) – rarely, 2 people (1%) never. On a question of the questionnaire "The teacher (mentor, curator) of this organization of education is for me an example as the professional doctor, the person (ethics, communications, appearance, speech)" completely agree 191 respondents (95.5%), 3 residents completely disagree, not all teachers of this organization of education noted 5 people (2.5%), 1 resident doubted with the answer. To the question, 191 residents (95.5%) answered "completely satisfied", 7 people (3.5%) "partially", 2 people (1%) "not completely satisfied". 187 students (93.5%) noted that they like to study in this educational institution, 11 people (5.5%) partially agree, 1 resident (0.5%) completely disagrees with this statement and 1 resident (0.5%) did not have an opinion. 195 people (97.5%) noted that they are satisfied with their relations with their fellow students, colleagues, medical personnel, 5 residents (2.5%) responded partially. 183 people (91.5%) noted that they did not personally experience negative attitudes of teachers, 10 residents (5%) answered "ever, deservedly", 6 people (3%) answered "yes, unfairly", 1 resident (0.5%) did not respond. 180 students (90%) are satisfied that they are studying in this educational institution, 18 residents (9%) answered yes, partially, 1 resident (0.5%) answered no, disappointed, 1 resident (0.5%) answered I do not know how to answer.

All students, 200 people (100%) noted the accessibility of the management of the organization of education for students. 148 students (74%) are engaged in scientific work, 21 residents (10.5%) are not engaged in science, 2 residents (1%) doubted with the answer, 21 residents (10.5%) plan to start, 7 residents (3.5%) wrote that they are in search of a research topic, 1 resident (0.5%) answered that they do not want to engage in research. When asked the questionnaire, "Do you personally have printed

works (articles, abstracts, reviews) published during your studies in this educational institution?", 108 people (54%) answered yes, one. 14 residents (7%) noted more than one job, 12 people (6%) not one, 48 people (24%) plan to publish in the near future, 9 residents (4.5%) answered "I just entered the training programme", 9 residents (4.5%) did not respond.

When asked the questionnaire, "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty you have chosen?", 189 people (94.5%) answered "yes, I am sure of it", 3 people (1.5%) are not sure of it, 4 people (2%) answered "I cannot answer this question yet", 3 residents (1.5%) answered "I would like to believe it" and 1 resident (0.5%) answered "I am beginning to doubt it". 186 students (93%) are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching, 12 people (6%) are partially satisfied, 2 people (1%) are dissatisfied with the organization of teaching. 179 respondents (89.5%) rated the work of the External Expert Commission on the accreditation of this organization of education positively, 15 people (7.5%) rated satisfactory, 6 people (3%) doubted with the answer. 176 people (88%) of residents agree with the statement that it is necessary to carry out accreditation of the organization of education or educational programmes. 15 people (7.5%) disagree, 2 people (1%) do not know what it is, 7 people (3.5%) doubted the answer. On the question of the questionnaire, "Did managers and/or teachers involve you in activities to prepare for institutional or specialized (programme) accreditation?" 152 residents (76%) answered "yes, when preparing the self-assessment report", 12 residents (6%) answered "yes, for the organization of a meeting of external experts", 22 residents (11%) – "yes, at all stages of preparation", 1 resident (0.5%) – "yes, since I speak a foreign language", 2 residents (1%) answered that they refused to participate for a good reason, 7 people (3.5%) answered no and 4 residents (2%) noted in the questionnaire that they first heard about accreditation when the commission arrived.

#### **The survey of teachers included 25 questions of the questionnaire.**

A total of 113 teachers were surveyed, including 28.3% with up to 5 years of work experience, 22.12% with 5-10 years of work experience, and 49.6% with more than 10 years of work experience. 58.4% noted that they teach in the residency.

Fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this educational institution- 74.3%, partially -22.1%, partially dissatisfied - 2.65%.

That in this organization of education ethics and subordination in the relations between colleagues, teachers are observed, the management noted 86,7% of respondents, 11,5%- agreed partially. Completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this organization of education -75.2%, partially agree 23.0% partially disagree 1.8%. In the organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and the development of teacher competencies, which was noted by 70.8% of respondents, 22.1% partially agree. 75.2% of respondents fully agree that in this organization of education they have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research, 16.8% partially agree, 3.5% partially disagree.

The salary suits completely 46,9% of respondents, disagree with it - 5,3%, more "Yes", than "no"- 27,4%, more isn't present, than Yes - 12,4%. Satisfied with the work of the HR service (personnel)- fully -83.2%, partially - 13.3%, completely not satisfied - 0.88%.

During this year, 49.6% of faculty members completed professional development courses (programmes), over 5 years ago -31.0%, they do not remember when it was 7.1%. It is believed that the discipline taught by the respondent is provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment) - fully -73.5% of respondents, partially -22.1%, partially disagree -2.7%. In this organization of education have the opportunity to realize as a professional in the specialty completely -81.4%, partially agree-13.3%, partially disagree - 0.9%. Personally participated in the development of the educational programme in the discipline that is taught: yes, active-63.7% of faculty members, no, did not participate-15.0%, were only electives-7.1%, were not involved in the work-6.2%.

60.2% of respondents note the timeliness of the fulfillment of requests for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization; 7.9% - untimely, the long wait for the application note -6.2% and have no

relation-15.0%.

They noted that the organization of education supports the participation of teaching staff in conferences (international, republican)- payment of travel, travel expenses, registration fee -21.2% of teaching staff, payment of travel only - 2.7%, does not pay any expenses - 2.7%, did not contact the management in this regard-30.9%. We fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university to improve their practical skills - 85.8% of teaching staff, partially agree -9.73%, doubt the answer - 4.42%. The publication activity of the TS is assessed on a scale of 5 points (from 1- low to 5 -high) - 17.1% as 1, as 2 -7.1%, 3-19.5%, 4-23.9%, 5-26.6%, did not give an answer-17.7%

On the question "Are social support programmes for teachers implemented in the educational organization?" replied: yes, there are such programmes 38.9%, yes, I have already used this - 2.65%, no-3.5%, I do not know about this - 44.3%, I doubt with the answer - 10.6%. 65,5% of respondents answered that yes, heads of the organization systematically listen to their opinion concerning questions on educational process, research, clinical work, yes, sometimes noted 18,6%, rather rarely - 0,88%. To the question: What teaching methods do you most often use in the process of teaching students (bachelors, residents, undergraduates)? The students noted that the lectures are used by - 48.7%, oral analysis of the topic of the lesson - 72.6%, rewriting of thematic information from monographs - 10.6%, problem-oriented training - 40.7%, interactive training - 46.9%, performance of abstracts - 34.5%, practical classes on clinical skills in the educational and clinical center - 56.6%, analysis of situational tasks -75.2%, compilation and solution of cases - 38.9%, oral survey of students - 61.1%, solution of tests - 48.7%, work in small groups - 53.9%, written completion of tasks - 28.3%

We fully agree that this questionnaire is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the organization's activities 70.8% of the TS, partially agree -14.2%, partially disagree 0.9%, completely disagree 2.6%. On a question: Whether you personally were involved in actions on preparation for accreditation of educational programmes answered that yes, included in the internal commission on self-assessment-31,9% of faculty; yes, was engaged in technical support before a meeting of the external expert commission - 16,81%; wrote sections of the report on self-assessment - 12,4%; collected information for annexes to the report on self-assessment - 15,9%; no, wasn't involved in preparation of higher education institution to accreditation - 23,9%.

We would like to personally become an expert on the accreditation of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health 35.4% of respondents are not interested in this graduation - 32.7%, have already participated in the work of the commissions on accreditation of this accreditation center - 4.4%. Question: Do you think that the work of the external expert commission on accreditation can fully cover all issues related to the quality of implementation of the educational programmes of the university answered - Yes, since the visit of the commission is preceded by the stage of self-assessment of the programme and writing a report -53.1PP; Yes, the commission investigates all the main processes of implementation of programmes - 35.4%; The programme of the visit of the commission is saturated and covers all key aspects of education - 28.3%; The programme of the commission includes interviews and interviews with stakeholders, allowing to draw conclusions about the quality of training - 34.5%; I do not think that a three-day visit of the commission will assess the quality of programmes - 5.3%; Everything depends on the professionalism and competence of accreditation experts - 22.1%; There are more effective assessment mechanisms, for example, state certification and audits -1.8%

Respondents noted what activities of external expert work on accreditation are most important and allow to obtain evidence of implementation of the Accreditation Standards: Interview with university management -7.96%; Interview with heads of educational programmes (heads of departments, deans)13.3 Interviews with students-11.5%; Interviews with programme graduates - 3.5%; Interviews with representatives of employers - 1.8%; Visiting practice bases - 3.5%; Survey of educational resources - 0.88%; Study of educational and methodological documentation - 0%; Interviews with teachers - 1.8%; Review of the self-assessment report of the programme - 0%;

Attending practical classes - 2.7%; Study of administrative documentation - 0.88%; All of the above - 45.1%.

The results of the survey are presented in the Attachment and demonstrate the positive aspects of training in residency programmes, at the same time they identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers and their participation in scientific conferences, increasing the publication activity of teaching staff, pedagogical competencies and improving the qualifications of teachers).

## **5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"**

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

##### **1.1 Mission statement and deliverables**

The staff of the Department of Dermatovenerology and Phthisiology, which implements the educational programme of residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" accepted the University Mission - "innovative, socially focused, practice-oriented, internationally recognized university", took it as the basis of the mission of the educational programme. Stakeholders (teachers, employers, residents) were informed about the mission of the EP in order to clearly understand the tasks and strive to meet the needs of practical health care.

The educational programme (EP) in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" is aimed at implementing the University's mission through the training of a qualified dermatovenerologist with a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activity in the treatment of skin and venereal diseases.

The department responsible for the residency programme applies a variety of innovations in the learning process, allowing to develop the basic and special competencies of residents, namely, working near the patient's bed, clinical debriefing, solving situational problems, protecting medical histories, training in laboratories.

##### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

Experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in decision-making in the development of the educational programme in terms of the component of choice, current and final assessment policy, including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral survey, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents (examination in the specialty), personnel policy for teachers under the accredited educational programme, as well as the allocation of resources (classroom fund of clinical bases according to contracts).

##### **1.3 Learning outcomes**

UICC determines the final results of training in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty of residency. The end results include knowledge, skills, analysis, communication skills and continuous learning of the resident, which constitute the foundation of the knowledge and skills of the dermatovenerologist. EP by its structure and methods of training forms the need to be aware of modern trends in medicine, to use evidence-based medicine data for diagnosis and effective practice of diseases, thus developing the skills of residents to lifelong learning

##### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

At the same time, the participation of practical health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme is not sufficiently reflected, the review is formalized and the feedback of practical health care is not collected when forming the components of choice.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17.

***Standard 1: Implemented***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none***

### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

## **Evidence of compliance:**

### **2.1 Postgraduate programme framework**

Accredited residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" is implemented in accordance with the State mandatory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 **No. KR DSM-12/2020**). In the NEI "KRMU", a modular system for organizing the educational process has been introduced, which provides for: a modular structure of the educational programme; the use of credit units (credits) to assess labor intensity; the use of point-rating systems for assessing knowledge; the participation of a resident in the formation of an individual curriculum; an increase in the share of self-learning in the educational process; an increase in the flexibility of educational programmes.

### **2.2 Scientific method**

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied. Involvement of residents for the implementation of small research projects and participation in the implementation of research of the department performed as part of the mastering of EP, develops the merits (qualities) of the researcher in students, teaches research methods and skills used in modern scientific practice. At the same time, residents are not fully involved in the scientific work of the department, do not have clearly defined research topics, performance criteria, including clinical studies.

### **2.3 Content of the residency programme**

The content, scope and sequence of the disciplines of the EP of the residency in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" strictly correspond to the SCES. At the heart of the achievement of training objectives in the specialty is the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies that profile (PGE) the disciplines of the main component and the component of choice (CC). The educational programme for training residents in this specialty is designed for 140 credits. The model of competencies of residents in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty has been introduced. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development and approval of the residency programme is clearly defined and regulated by the CEP.

### **2.4 Programme structure, content and duration**

The structure of the residency specialty 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" is formed from various types of educational, scientific, clinical activities and practices that determine the content of education, reflects their ratio, measurement and accounting. The EP is implemented in accordance with the State Standardization Committee of 2020 and provides the necessary level of training of residents, includes the relevant specialized disciplines.

The educational programme provides a sequence of studying disciplines based on their continuity, the rational distribution of disciplines by semesters from the standpoint of uniformity of the academic work of the resident.

### **2.5 Organization of training**

The personnel of the department has the necessary competencies for training residents, but at the same time mentors, represented by the staff of clinical bases despite the professional level, do not fully master pedagogical techniques, which limits the implementation of high-quality transfer of professional knowledge and skills. Teachers of departments use various methods of active (business games, brainstorming, clinical debriefing, case-studies, etc.) and traditional (oral debriefing, mini-lectures) training, according to which staff members periodically study within the university, less often in other organizations. The Residency Department and the CEP of postgraduate education constantly monitor this process and train newly recruited teachers through the School of Teachers.

### **2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care**

Due to the availability of clinical facilities for residents (RSVD, CSVD, KSCDID), they spend most of their study time in close contact with patients, medical documentation, including automated health care systems. Mentors have been training residents since the last one. Patient supervision allows



residents to master diagnostic and treatment procedures in the course of daily clinical activities. Multidisciplinary clinics have a broad profile of departments and emergency conditions, which allows residents to see and supervise a sufficient number of patients with a variety of pathologies corresponding to the cycle of disciplines.

When conducting interviews with residents, experts made sure that the organization of training and work is patient-oriented, at the same time, there is not always a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for theoretical analyses of complex topics and study of literature in modern databases.

Thus, the educational programme of the residency in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, including pediatric" demonstrates the integration between training and the provision of medical care

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Compliant with 31 standards: full – 31.

***Standard 2: Implemented***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1) Ensure alternative choice with expansion of the list of elective disciplines based on the opinions of residents and employers (2.1.7.)

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

##### **1.1 Methods of valuation**

In the NEI "KRMU", in accordance with the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 2, 2016 No. 124, a resident assessment policy was developed and implemented, including the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the "Academic Policy of the University" (Order No.1 dated August 27, 2021), in the Regulation on the current monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students (PL-03-35-11 dated August 27, 2021). The responsibility for the implementation of the policy on assessing the educational achievements of residents is borne by the faculty of the department, the head of the department (modules), the registrar's office.

To ensure the maximum objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the department has developed checklists for conducting current, midterm and final control of the discipline ( Mini-cEX, CbD, OSCE, ).

As an additional method of evaluating residents, portfolios are used, which experts familiarized themselves with at the departments supervising the residency programme. Residents are engaged in research work, which necessarily should culminate in the publication of a scientific article or a report at scientific and practical conferences. The assessment of scientific work also affects the overall assessment of the discipline.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Standard of the RoK 2017, 2020. in the specialties of residency. The results of students' educational achievements are recorded in the electronic educational journal through the office-registrator system and the AIS Platonus programme.

##### **3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training**

The methods used to assess the competencies of students in the NEI "KRMU" are defined in the syllabuses for the disciplines, which are discussed and approved at the departmental meetings, the CEP, the AC, the SC.

The assessment methods are fully comparable to the teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all the competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations. The assessment of educational achievements uses various types of control and measuring tools developed by the departments (control questions, tasks in test form, situational tasks, practical and communicative skills, etc.).

The procedure for planning, organizing, monitoring and analyzing evaluation methods in the CMD ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring tools is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in the assessment of knowledge

in the residency, then implemented at the department. At the same time, no examples of test validation were presented to the experts.

*The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria* of 11 standards: fully -11, significantly-0, partially – 0, do not meet – 0.

**Standard 3:** Implemented

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Introduce psychometric analysis of test tasks based on the relevant software (for example, the IteMan programme) (3.1.6.).
- 2) Include a module on teaching methods and assessment methods in the advanced training of teaching staff (3.2.2)
- 3) Revise the assessment methods and use the assessment sheets corresponding to the specialty profile (3.2.2.)

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission and Selection Policy**

Admission to the residency in KRMU is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to education in educational institutions that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education". The conditions for admission of students to these universities are prescribed in the "Rules for admission to the residency" (PR-03-11-05 of 24.07.2020). The criteria for applicants entering the residency are determined by the requirements of the State Standard of Education and Training of the Republic of Kazakhstan, according to which the previous level of education of persons wishing to master the educational programmes of the residency: basic medical education, higher medical education, internship.

Questions about admission to residency educational programmes are posted on the university's website <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/> and in the admission commission.

#### **4.2 Number of residents**

In order to ensure a balance between the existing capacity and the opportunities for training students of the residency in preparation for the new academic year, the availability of resources of the EP is monitored. The number of places in the residency is determined based on the possibilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical health care.

The peculiarity of admission to the residency "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" in this organization and other medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan is that for this specialty for 15 years there is no admission for educational grants. Accordingly, it is necessary to look for opportunities to train residents in this specialty on LEB grants

#### **4.3 Resident support and advice**

In KRMU, a system of academic consulting of residents is built, when each resident is assigned a curator from among the faculty members of the department. In addition, the resident is assigned a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained. Its function is to direct the resident to master the practical skills and competencies necessary for the resident in the process of his education, which is reflected in the Academic Policy of the University.

In the event of a professional crisis or disagreement in principle with the supervisor or colleagues, the resident is supported by the Residence Department.

All information about the university and about service services is presented on the website of KazRosMedUniversity. Residents are also informed about the services by corporate mail residency @ [medkrmu.kz](mailto:medkrmu.kz), by chat in the phone, by e-mail.

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

The quality of the implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the participation of residents in the discussion of the mission of the university and the EP. Students, together with the university teaching staff, have a real opportunity to participate in the assessment of the specialty's EP

during direct discussion and approval of work programmes, at the level of developing an individual work curriculum and a catalog of elective disciplines (order for the composition of the CEP No. 26-02-62-n/k dated 26.08.2021)

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

In accordance with the current agreements with clinical bases (Agreements are attached) "The Clinic undertakes to ensure the admission of students to patients and to all structural units of the Clinic, including the basic departments, the operating unit, the intensive care unit, the intensive care unit in accordance with the needs of the educational process, except for cases when the admission of students to the treatment process is not allowed by the current legislation and / or the requirements of patients". Students under EP 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" have the opportunity to participate in weekly clinical rounds, consultations, medical councils at the University clinical bases both as listeners and as speakers. Actively participate in holding Open Days, health schools on clinical bases.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 30 standards: fully -29, partially - 1, non-compliant - 0

#### **Standard 4: Implemented**

##### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Modify the admission policy to take into account the specific abilities of applicants in order to improve the effectiveness of training and transparency of the process (develop clear and objective criteria for assessment during the entrance examinations to the residency (4.1.4,4.1.6)
- 2) Include representatives of resident associations in the process of development of the policy of admission and selection of residents (4.1.8.)

#### **Standard 5: FACULTY**

##### **Evidence of compliance:**

##### **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

The University has developed and successfully operates the document "Personnel Policy", approved at US No.5 dated December 25, 2020, which reflects: selection and admission of employees, development and activities of employees, promotion of employees, etc.

The University pays great attention to the selection and recruitment of qualified personnel, as well as their training. The selection and recruitment of employees is carried out by competitive selection in accordance with the established requirements.

At the moment, the total number of teaching staff of the Department of Dermatovenerology is 16 people, of which 10 are full-time teachers, 6 are part-time teachers. Doctor of Science -1, Candidates of Science -6, Masters -1. The average age of the teaching staff is 48 years.

The teaching staff is formed on the basis of the needs for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total amount of study load. Clinical mentors from practical health care engaged to teach residents are subject to such requirements as the availability of basic education, the availability of a medical qualification category and sufficient experience in the specialty. The faculty members of the department are constantly improving their qualifications.

The University improves the selection of personnel to achieve its mission and goals, incentives for personnel, taking into account their scientific, clinical and pedagogical merits, promotions, awards and rewards.

##### **5.2 Teachers' obligations and development**

The management of the NEI "KRMU" in accordance with the needs to improve the level of teaching, improve the final results of training, increases the material and technical base for improving the qualification level and scientific potential of teaching staff conducting training in the residency. To implement this task, the NEI "KRMU" has the following units: the School of the Teacher, the Institute of Postgraduate Education, winter and summer schools, which contribute to the formation and enhancement of the competencies and potential of the teaching staff.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 7 standards: fully -7.

### *Standard 5: Implemented*

#### ***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1) In job descriptions, more clearly present the differentiation of positions according to the criteria for performing scientific work (for example, publication activity, the Hirsch index, etc.) (5.1.1.)

### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

The University has a developed material and technical base for the professional training of residents in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children". The University has 2 educational buildings with a total area of  $12,706.4 \text{ m}^2$ , a sports hall, 1 dormitory for 200 seats. The University has a sufficiently good material and technical base for the educational process. The study rooms are equipped with all the necessary equipment, visual aids, educational material in electronic form, methodological developments in each discipline, and innovative technologies for interactive teaching methods. This makes it possible to ensure that the educational process is conducted in accordance with educational standards.

However, during the visit to the clinical base, it was revealed that the equipment at the department is obsolete, in order to improve the quality of the educational process, it is necessary to purchase a dermatoscope with software support.

#### **6.2 Clinical Bases**

Clinical bases for residents studying in the specialty "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" are: RSVD with a bed capacity of -60 inpatient beds and 10 day beds, as well as an outpatient polyclinic department) KSCDID - with a 50-bed inpatient hospital and an advisory polyclinic, CSVD - with 20 inpatient beds and an outpatient polyclinic department. CB has a sufficient bed capacity, the Department of Dermatovenerology has a sufficient number of classrooms for practical classes and independent work of residents.

#### **6.3 Information technology**

Information support for the work of residents is carried out through: the media (Facebook, Telegramm, etc.) University website - University <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/>; TV monitors in the lobby of educational buildings; boards of official information of the Residency Department and university departments. Automation, in accordance with the credit technology of the educational process is carried out with the Platonus information system, as well as using the Moodle distance learning platform. Each resident has a login and password to log in to the Platonus system, Moodle, has the opportunity to use the services of an electronic library. Students have the opportunity to receive all educational and methodological literature in electronic form, both at the department and in the library. The university provided each department with Internet access. However, during the experts' visit to the department and the library, it was established that there was no access to the Up to Date and Cochrane Library evidence bases

#### **6.4 Clinical Teams**

The programme of training of residents in the specialty 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" includes the skills of working in a team and effective interaction with other health care specialists. Residents together with the staff of clinical bases work out skills of professionalism in all spheres of their activity: participation in selector republican and city meetings, in scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams.

The department provides training for residents in an interdisciplinary team by conducting master classes, classes in the form of a "standardized patient", team-oriented training, clinical debriefings, pathology conferences.

#### **6.5 Medical Research and Advances**

The scientific interests of the employees of the Department of Dermatovenerology are determined by the profile of the clinical base and the specialty. The research work of the department is regulated by

the plan of research work. Theoretical and practical issues of diagnostics of skin diseases and sexually transmitted diseases are the priority areas of research of the department staff. The result of the work is the publication of residents together with a teacher, participation in scientific grants and making speeches at conferences. For example: resident dermatovenerologists participated in the research "development of distance learning modules within the framework of the Global Fund grant", taking an active part in the collection of medical information.

### **6.6 Education expertise**

Examination of the quality of the implemented EP residency is a mandatory stage of the educational process and is carried out by the following structures of the NEI "KRMU": departments (planning, development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), CEP (planning, development, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), AWD (coordination, control of compliance with the NLA, monitoring, evaluation of the EP), EP (implementation, monitoring, revision of the EP), EP and PMC (coordination, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), AC (approval, evaluation, revision of the EP), Training Council (approval, evaluation, revision of the EP). The EP examination procedure is prescribed in the Regulation on the Commission for Quality Assurance in higher Educational Programmes, the composition of which was approved by Order No. 26-02-70 dated 06.09.21.

### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

To organize and implement academic mobility, the University has organized a department of academic mobility, which is actively working to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities, but due to the current epidemiological situation, this programme was not implemented.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 21 standards conform: fully -18, partially -3, do not meet - 0

*Standard 6: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

- 1) Expand access to Up to Date and Cochrane Library evidence bases (6.1.1.)
- 2) Strengthen the material and technical base by purchasing a dermatoscope with software support (6.1.2.)
- 3) Provide residents with the opportunity to study in alternative organizations inside or outside the country, i.e. expand academic mobility (improve funding mechanisms for the development of academic mobility of residents and TS) (6.7.1, 6.7.3., 6.7.4., 8.3.3.).

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

Monitoring and evaluation of EP includes the following stages: discussion, review, revision taking into account proposals and comments made by employers and other stakeholders, recommendation for approval, approval procedure.

Improvement of the procedure for evaluating the programme at the level of the university, the residency department, departments / courses is carried out through discussion of the context of the programme and special disciplines at the meetings of the CEP, the vice-rector for scientific and clinical activities, followed by discussion of all members of the Academic Council of the university. A separate section of the annual report of the structural unit reflects the work carried out during the academic year to improve the material and technical base of clinical bases and the material equipment of the department.

One of the important conditions for continuous monitoring and improving the quality of the educational process is the correction of EP on the basis of feedback with the participation of stakeholders (teachers, students, employers and other stakeholders)

#### **7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents**

Teachers and residents have the opportunity to participate in the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the educational programme on a regular basis through different channels of feedback.

Confirmation of the effectiveness of the education received is also based on the results of feedback - an annual survey of students assessing the level of satisfaction with educational programmes. (<https://drive.google.com>). As a result of the questionnaire analysis, changes and additions are made to the EP.

### **7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates**

The Residence Department collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process in the form of a questionnaire, monitoring of appeals to the rector's blog, discussion of current issues in the social network. The survey of graduates of the residency of the "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" is also carried out annually (questionnaires are developed and approved)

### **7.4 Stakeholder Engagement**

Employers are the main stakeholders in the assessment of the EP. In KRMU, the Career Center conducted a sociological study in 2021 "Satisfaction of employers with the graduates of the NEI "KRMU". 30 employers (60% response rate) from 6 oblasts and the city of Almaty were interviewed. The results of a survey of employers on the quality of training for graduates of this university in 2021 showed that no employer rated the quality of training low.

Annually, round tables are held with employers (programme and minutes of April 23, 2021). Based on the feedback results, the analysis of nonconformities is carried out, the causes of the nonconformities are determined, the need for corrective measures is assessed, correction is made (a corrective action plan is drawn up), and then the effectiveness and efficiency of the actions taken are registered and analyzed. The results of feedback and corrective actions are heard at meetings of the department, the CEP, the Academic Council.

Taking into account the needs of practical health care and the recommendations of employers, the Department of Dermatovenerology has developed the following elective disciplines: "Fundamentals of dermatoscopy" and "Psychosomatic disorders in dermatovenerology".

### **7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes**

The NEI "KRMU" has developed a mechanism for approving educational programmes. The CEP carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, achieving tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the training methodology), as well as an assessment of the educational and methodological support and support of the educational process. The EP is approved at the meeting of the Chair, the CEP and the Academic Council.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: fully -15.

*Standard 7: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **8.1 Control**

When implementing postgraduate education, the KRMU is guided by the Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", "On Approval of the State Educational Order for the Training of Specialists with Higher and Postgraduate Education", the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Approval of the Rules for Placing a State Order, Admission to Training and Training of Medical Personnel in the Residence", the Standard Rules for Admission to Training in the Organization of Education, the State Educational Standard of the Residence, which regulate the amount of the state educational order for the training of residents in the field of health care.

#### **8.2 Academic Leadership**

The academic policy, <https://krmu.edu.kz/akademicheskaya-chestnost/>, which regulates in detail the rights, obligations and responsibilities of students and the University administration, the procedure for organizing the educational process, is annually reviewed and approved in the NEI "KRMU". These

rules stipulate the officials responsible for the proper implementation of the Rules and the scope of their responsibility.

### **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The budget of the NEI "KRMU" is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and the provision of paid educational services. It should be noted that there is no educational grant for the specialty "Dermatovenerology adult, paediatric" in the last 15 years, therefore, training is only paid, so it is necessary to look for the possibility of training under the LEB grant.

### **8.4 Administration and Management**

The organizational structure is annually amended and supplemented by the KRMU. The staffing table of departments providing educational programmes of the residency is approved annually taking into account changes in the number of students. According to Art.52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated 27.07.2007. No. 319-III, the total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of an average ratio of residents and teachers – 3:1. The University has defined the general strategy, main directions, priorities and objectives of the University's policy in the field of improving the quality of education in accordance with the University's mission, vision and strategic development plan.

### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The Regulation on Residency was developed in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Concept for the Development of Medical Education and determines the procedure for training medical personnel in the Residency in the organizations of medical education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, regardless of the forms of ownership, having a license for this type of educational activity and clinical bases.

Interaction of the University with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the organization of the educational process in the residency is carried out through the development and implementation of the SES 2022 (professor Ligai Z.N., associate professor Imanbayeva Zh.A.) are part of the committees of project management groups at the EMA Rums, also participate in all methodological meetings. Head of the Department of Dermatovenerology, Candidate of Medical Sciences Tolybekova A.A. and Professor of the Department of Dermatovenerology, Doctor of Medical Sciences Askarova G.K. are part of the State Unitary Enterprise by specialty, participate in all methodological meetings.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: fully -15.

*Standard 8: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

In the NEI "KRMU", on the basis of the analysis of reforming in the field of education and health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, changes in the practice of world educational management, if necessary, the organizational structure of management is revised. In different years, new structural units were created and added, such as the Center for Youth Policy, the Institute of Postgraduate Education, the School of the Teacher, the Quality Management System Department, etc., the functional tasks of which are aimed at ensuring the quality of educational programmes.

Study, monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology for adults, children" is carried out at all levels, includes the profiling (graduating) and related departments, the profile Committee of the educational programme, the Academic Council.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 4 standards: fully – 4.

*Standard 9: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

**6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology for adults, children":**

1. Ensure alternative choice with expansion of the list of elective disciplines based on the opinions of residents and employers (2.1.7.)
2. Introduce psychometric analysis of test tasks based on the relevant software (for example, the IteMan programme) (3.1.6.).
3. Include a module on teaching methods and assessment methods in the advanced training of teaching staff (3.2.2)
4. Revise the assessment methods and use the assessment sheets corresponding to the specialty profile (3.2.2.)
5. Modify the admission policy to take into account the specific abilities of applicants to improve the effectiveness of training and transparency of the process (develop clear and objective evaluation criteria for the entrance examinations to the residency (4.1.4,4.1.6)
6. Include representatives of resident associations in the process of development of the resident admission and selection policy (4.1.8.)
7. Expand access to Up to Date and Cochrane Library evidence bases (6.1.1.)
8. Strengthen the material and technical base by purchasing a dermatoscope with software support (6.1.2.)
9. Provide residents with the opportunity to study in alternative organizations inside or outside the country, i.e. expand academic mobility (improve funding mechanisms for the development of academic mobility of residents and TS) (6.7.1, 6.7.3., 6.7.4., 8.3.3.).



### 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

EEC members have established the compliance of the educational programme **7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology for adults, children"** with the Accreditation Standards and have come to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of **5** years.

Chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich
Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov
Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Kudabaeva Khatima Ilyasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbayevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tezekbaev Kanat Mardenovich
Kazakh Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Eltai Utemuratovich
Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva
Resident Representative	Ermekbai Abay Amanzholuly

Observer for ECAQA M.A. Umarova

  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  


**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMME	31	31		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11		
4.	STUDENTS	30	29	1	
5.	FACULTY	7	7		
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	18	3	
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15		
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	<b>Subtotal:</b>	<b>151</b>	<b>147</b>	<b>4</b>	
			<b>151</b>		

## List of documents studied by the members of the EEC as part of the external expert evaluation

<b>№</b>	<b>Name of the document</b>	<b>Identification number</b>	<b>Date of approval</b>
1	Personnel policy	R-01-23-01	25.12.2020
2	Regulations on social support for students	P-03-21-06	21.06.2019
3	Regulations on the Commission for ensuring the academic quality of the educational programme	PL-03-36-08	26.08.2021
4	Regulation on the Test Committee	RB-03-18-04	28.10.2021
5	Rules for admission to the residency	PR-03-11-05	24.07.2020
6	Regulations on on-site training in internship and residency	PL-03-11-07	29.08.2019
7	Teacher Honor Code		12.12.2017
8	Regulations on the Organization of Training with the Use of Distance Education Technologies	PL-03-37-05	29.08.2019
9	Regulation on the Board of Curators	PL-03-21-08	18.11.2019
10	Regulation on the assessment of students' knowledge	PL-03-35-10	29.08.2019
11	Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students	PL-03-35-11	29.08.2019
12	Rules for Granting Academic Leave to Students	PR-03-35-12	29.08.2019
13	Code of Academic Integrity	K-03-36-05	27.04.2019
14	Rules of Internal Regulations for Students	PR-03-36-08	29.08.2019
15	Regulations on the Committee for Educational Programmes	PL-03-17-06	29.08.2019
16	Rules for using the "Anti-plagiarism. University" system	PR-03-17-10	29.08.2019
17	Regulation on the processing, protection and storage of personal data of employees and students	PL-03-23-06	17.06.2019
18	Clinical Instructor Statement	PL-03-11-08	17.06.2019
19	Academic Policy	R-01-17-14	27.08.2021